

# Report to the Municipal Council

Author: Priska Pschaid

Reference number: A6F – 18343/2012

Subject: Evaluation report on the Gender Equality Action Plan “House Graz” 2013 – 2014 and presentation of the up-dated Gender Equality Action Plan valid as of October 2015

Committee for Youth and Family, Women’s Affairs,  
Senior Citizens, and Science  
Committee for Constitutional Matters, Organisation,  
Gender Mainstreaming, Civil Protection and Fire  
Service, International Relations and Human Rights

Rapporteurs: .....

Graz, 1 Oct. 2015

In its meeting in October 2012, the municipal council decided to sign the “EU Charter for Equality of Women and Men in Local Life” and adopted the first Gender Equality Action Plan “House Graz” for the period 2013 – 2014. The present report describes current developments at the European level and the degree of implementation of the First Gender Equality Action Plan and submits an up-dated Gender Equality Action Plan.

The practical implementation over the past two years has highlighted one thing: The First Gender Equality Action Plan of the city of Graz had set itself very ambitious goals for the period 2013 – 2014. In this, Graz finds itself in good company at a European level. Although the degree of implementation by the city of Graz is a very high one and can be regarded as a success, a Europe-wide comparison shows that many communities are confronted with the same problems. This was discussed at great length, for example, at EIGE’s - the European Institute of Gender Equality - in Vilnius, at the first conference of the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR) of the German Association of Towns and Cities in Frankfurt and at conferences of the Observatory of the Charter in Brussels, and it was also addressed at the international FemCities conference held in Graz in April 2014.

Another issue relates to the choice of appropriate indicators based on which implementation is to be measured. Not all of the indicators selected turned out to be meaningful. Moreover, it became apparent that communities across Europe are encountering similar difficulties as regards documentation. Nobody wants to create “data graveyards”, yet the data collected provides the basis for drawing comparisons across the years, and – given the multitude of gender equality actions which have already been implemented or are under implementation in the municipalities - it is virtually impossible to take stock of all of them. This is true, in particular, of the city of Graz, which is still playing a pioneering role at a European level in pursuing gender equality.

It deserves special mention and can be very well observed in Graz that, while there is no doubt that there is still a lot to do, the active cultural change can already be felt. Many implementation measures simply *do* happen without any “instructions”, without being enshrined in a project, but simply because it is the standard which is followed. This is a remarkable step forward which many municipalities have still failed to take. Gender is in the mainstream!

Prompted by the question of appropriate documentation and how to measure the implementation of the Charter for Equality, the Council of European Municipalities and Regions (CEMR) set up a new Observatory of the Charter in 2013 - <http://www.charter-equality.eu> – which prepared an atlas of all signatory municipalities (1747 municipalities from 33 countries have already signed the Charter) and actively addresses the question of how many of the signatory municipalities are actually in the position of presenting an Equality Action Plan, whose preparation is binding, and to what extent it is being implemented.

Early in 2014, the European Commissions assigned the Observatory of the Charter the pilot project “Development of Indicators to Measure the Implementation of the European Charter of Women and Men in Local Life”. The project was realised in 2014, involving national experts (for Austria, the Unit Women & Equality of the city of Graz was nominated). The crucial question when developing appropriate indicators has always been: Are we really measuring the right things? And: At what level is the comparison at the European level a fair one? Another key issue is: How can all parties involved manage and process the indicators?

The indicators developed in the course of this project were tested widely throughout Europe until March 2015, using data for the year 2013. Graz was, of course, involved.

To illustrate why the up-dated Gender Equality Action Plan is being adapted step-by-step to the European indicators, a short description of the project of the Observatory in Brussels is given below:

In the first part, six horizontal indicators are queried. The possible answers are in each case: yes/no/I don't know or not responsible. Examples:

- \* ) The existence of a formal obligation on the part of the local authorities to ensure gender equality in the following realms of politics: Equal participation of women and men in political and civilian life; in public procurement and awarding of contracts; employment; education; etc.
- \* ) The availability of gender-specific data at local level in all areas covered by the Charter.

In the second part, 69 basic and optional local indicators are listed as specified in the 30 articles in the nine defined areas of action of the Charter (democratic responsibility, political role, general framework for gender equality, the role of employers, public procurement and awarding of contracts, the role of service providers, planning and sustainable development, the role of the regulatory authority, town twinning and international co-operation). Concrete figures are only requested for the following 13 indicators:

- 1) number of inhabitants
- 2) number of women and men in elected positions (at a political level – municipal council, in administration and in bodies/advisory committees)
- 3) share of women and men in gender-specific professions : police, public health care and child care
- 4) share of women and men in top management or at top organisational level
- 5) number of employees using parental part-time work, flexible working schemes or part-time working schemes
- 6) percentage of children in formal care, broken down according to age groups and care times per week
- 7) the share of women and men benefiting from programmes provided by local authorities, aimed at protection from poverty and social exclusion
- 8) the share of women and men in leading positions of the two largest sports and cultural clubs run by the local authorities

- 9) the number of female and male entrepreneurs in relation to the total number of registered companies.

For all other indicators, the possible answers are: yes/no/I don't know or not responsible or always/regularly/occasionally/never.

The evaluation of the indicators has shown that the "existence of ...." is one of the essential indicators proving that the implementation of the Charter is in progress. In comparison, the Graz Gender Equality Action Plan – as shown in the enclosed evaluation – included too detailed indicators, and not all of them turned out to be meaningful/appropriate.

Until the autumn of 2015, discussions were held with the Observatory on a co-ordinated approach as regards the indicators. Since we do not intend to adopt a two-pronged approach in working with the indicators and since the city of Graz has every interest in improving their quality – in co-operation with the Observatory –, the future indicators will be adjusted step-by-step to the EU guidelines. However, while the evaluation period will be maintained, the action period will not be defined any longer.

### **Summary of the Evaluation for the City of Graz:**

- 1) **Field of Action "Work, Employment and Business"**: Seven gender equality objectives and 15 measures were defined in the GAP, with eleven measures being related to services provided by the city of Graz and projects, respectively, which are carried out (successfully) on an ongoing basis. Four measures were related to new projects and/or temporary projects. One (temporary) EU project – Senior Capital – was completed successfully. One project was implemented successfully, but discontinued because of the lack of utilisation (income transparency data base). Two projects (EU project "Silver City") and a new concept for the "Boys' Day" were not implemented.
- 2) **Field of Action "Eradicating Gender Stereotypes"**: Five gender equality objectives and eleven measures were defined in the GAP, with six measures being related to current measures/projects; one project was completed successfully (exhibition on feminism/equal opportunities at the GrazMuseum, transfer of the DOKU archive to the GrazMuseum; two projects (Boys' Day, pilot project on gender-sensitive kindergarten pedagogy) were not carried out; and one project (integration of the gender perspective in school social work) was postponed. One project was implemented in part (training of employees in the field of public relations).
- 3) **Field of Action "Education"**: Three gender equality objectives and six measures were defined in the GAP. Four measures are being implemented successfully on an ongoing basis; one project was postponed.
- 4) **Field of Action "Health and Social Security"**: Three gender equality objectives and eight measures were defined in the GAP. All eight measures are being implemented on an ongoing basis.
- 5) **Field of Action: "Equal Access to Services and Funding"**: Two gender quality objectives and eleven measures were defined in the GAP: Nine measures are being implemented successfully on an ongoing basis; two measures (taking into account gender and diversity criteria in the framework of general economic development and the promotion of women who wish to set up their own businesses) were not implemented.
- 6) **Field of Action "Safety, Security and Protection from Violence"**: Two gender equality objectives and two measures were defined in the GAP. Both measures were implemented in manifold ways.

- 7) **Field of Action “Internal Equality”**: Six gender equality objectives and thirteen measures were defined in the GAP. Nine measures are being implemented successfully on an ongoing basis; one measure has been implemented in part (Gender Impact Assessment in the human resources sector); two measures (consideration of periods of maternal and paternal leave for moving up the pay scale and considering them as an asset in job applications) have to be revised (i.a. for legal reasons); one measure (educational programmes relating to gender and diversity) was implemented after adaptation.

**Conclusion:** Out of 66 measures, 56 were/are being implemented (on an ongoing basis), ten measures could not be implemented or only in part. An encouraging result!

#### **Summary of the Evaluation of Holding Graz GmbH:**

- 1) **Field of Action “Leadership and Management”**: Four fields of action and ten measures were defined in the Gender Equality Action Plan. Five measures were implemented; one measure is being implemented on an ongoing basis; one measure was implemented in part. Three measures have not been implemented and will be included in the Holding’s updated Action Plan.
- 2) **Field of Action “Human Resources Management”**: Twelve fields of action and 21 measures were defined in the Gender Equality Action Plan. Sixteen measures were implemented or are being implemented on an ongoing basis; two measures were implemented in part. Three measures have not been implemented and will be included in the new Action Plan or adapted upon modification of the project.
- 3) **Field of Action “Internal and External Communication”**: Four fields of action and eight measures were defined in the Gender Equality Action Plan. Two measures were not implemented; one measure is being implemented successfully on an ongoing basis; five measures are in the phase of implementation.
- 4) **Field of Action “Customer Relations”**: Two fields of action and two measures were defined in the Gender Equality Action Plan. Both measures are being implemented on an ongoing basis.
- 5) **Field of Action “Controlling and Legal Affairs”**: Four fields of action and six measures were defined in the Gender Equality Action Plan. Two measures were implemented, two measures were not implemented and two measures are being implemented on an ongoing basis.

**Conclusion:** Out of 48 measures, 38 were/are being implemented (on an ongoing basis); ten measures could not be implemented or only in part. Again, an encouraging result!

#### **Summary of the Evaluation of the Gender Equality Action Plan of Building and Construction Management Graz (GBG):**

Both of the major measures “Taking into Consideration the Promotion of Women and of Gender Aspects in the Awarding of Contracts” and “Taking into Consideration Gender and Diversity Criteria in Construction Tenders and Requests for Proposals” were implemented successfully and are being implemented on an ongoing basis. **This truly marks a milestone!**

#### **Summary of the Evaluation of the Gender Equality Policies at the Children’s Museum:**

Seven of the eight gender equality objectives were implemented successfully with eight concrete measures.

**Conclusion:** Again, an encouraging result!

## **Updated Equality Action Plan**

The updated Equality Action Plan for the House Graz, which is valid as of October 2015, on the one hand continues to include important measures/indicators (such as, for example, the number of childcare facilities) and, on the other hand, measures which have not been implemented or only in part will be pursued further (this applies also to the Holding). Indicators which turned out to be inadequate were eliminated. However, the most important change concerns the adjustment to the EU indicators, as mentioned above. Further adjustments are made in respect of the EU priority "Delivery of Social Services". Moreover, importance is attached to the impact and effectiveness of the equality targets.

As the adjustment to the EU standards is a gradual process and since regular adjustments are expected, the updated Equality Action Plan is submitted without specifying a time horizon. However, the two-year evaluation period will be maintained, as will the seven fields of action. The new "GAP" defines 28 equality targets and 58 measures of implementation.

Based on Article 45(2) second line of the Statutes of the Capital City of Graz 1967, Regional Law Gazette No. 130/1967 in the version of the Regional Law Gazette No. 8/2012, the Committee for Youth and Family, Women's Affairs, Senior Citizens and Science and the Committee for Constitutional Matters, Organisation, Gender Mainstreaming, Civil Protection and Fire Service, International Relations and Human Rights put forward in their

### **MOTION**

that the Municipal Council may resolve as follows:

1. The Evaluation of the First Gender Equality Action Plan of the House Graz 2013 – 2014, which is appended to the Report to the Municipal Council, is taken note of.
2. The updated Gender Equality Action Plan – as adjusted to the relevant EU standards – and as valid as of October 2015 – is approved.
3. The two-year evaluation period is approved.
4. The overall co-ordination is entrusted to the Unit for Women & Equality.

#### **Enclosures:**

Evaluation of the First Gender Equality Action Plan of the House Graz 2013 - 2014

Evaluation of the Gender Equality Action Plan of Holding Graz GmbH

Evaluation of the Gender Equality Action Plan of the Children's Museum Graz GmbH

Folder "Gender Mainstreaming in Building Schools" – Building and Construction Management (GBG)

Updated Gender Equality Action Plan House Graz, valid as of October 2015

The authoress:

Priska Pschaid

GR-Bericht Evaluierung GAP

GR Oktober 2015 GZ: A6F-18343/2012

The Head of the Municipal Authorities:

Martin Haidvogel

(signed electronically)

(signed electronically)

The City Senate Representative:

Deputy Mayoress Martina Schröck  
(signed electronically)

The Mayor:

Siegfried Nagl  
(signed electronically)

In its meeting of ..... 2015, the Municipal Council Committee for Youth, and Family, Women’s Affairs, Senior Citizens and Science and in its meeting of ..... 2015 the Committee for Constitutional Matters, Organisation, Gender Mainstreaming, Civil Protection and Fire Service, International Relations and Human Rights discussed and adopted the above report prepared by the Unit for Women and Equality.

The Chairwoman of the Committee for Youth and Family, Women’s Affairs, Senior Citizens and Science

The Secretary:

(Alexandra Marak-Fischer)

Sylvia Bruder

The Chairman of the Committee for Constitutional Matters, Organisation, Gender Mainstreaming, Civil Defence and Fire Service, International Relations and Human Rights

(Peter Piffl-Percevic)

<b>The motion was adopted today in</b>		<input type="checkbox"/>	the public	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>non-public Municipal Council Meeting</b>
<input type="checkbox"/>	in the presence of ..... municipal councillors				
<input type="checkbox"/>	by unanimous vote	<input type="checkbox"/>	by majority vote (with ..... votes in favour/.....votes against).		
<input type="checkbox"/>	For details of the resolution see separate sheet.				
Graz, .....			The Secretary:		